

Appendix 5.4. Criteria for Grading Panel Discussions

Strengths and Weaknesses

4	Strengths and weaknesses of the novel are presented and supported through specific references to the novel.
3	Strengths and weaknesses of the novel are presented and partially supported through referencing the novel.
2	Strengths and weaknesses are discussed with little support from the novel.
1	Strengths and/or weaknesses are minimally discussed, with no support.
0	No discussion of strengths and weaknesses.

Main Ideas and Themes

4	Main ideas/themes are discussed and supported through specific examples from the novel.
3	Main ideas/themes are discussed with partial support from the novel.
2	Main ideas/themes are discussed with little support from the novel.
1	The main ideas/themes of the novel are minimally discussed, with no support.
0	No discussion of main ideas/themes.

Action, Time, and Space (Elements of Visual Literacy)

4	The novel's graphic elements (time, space, action) are discussed in terms of their effect on the novel's meaning, with thorough supporting evidence.
3	Some or all of the novel's graphic elements are discussed in terms of their effect on the novel's meaning, with some supporting evidence.
2	Some or all of the novel's graphic elements are discussed in terms of their effect on the novel's meaning, with little supporting evidence.
1	Some or all of the novel's graphic elements are discussed in terms of their effect on the novel's meaning, with no supporting evidence.
0	No discussion of the novel's graphic elements.

Characterization

4	An analysis of one or more main characters is presented and supported with specific examples.
3	An analysis of one or more main characters is presented and partially supported with specific examples.
2	An analysis of one or more main characters is presented with little support from specific examples.
1	An analysis of one or more main characters is minimally discussed, with no supporting evidence.
0	No analysis of main characters.

Baseball Culture

4	Conclusions about baseball culture, based on the novel, are discussed and supported with examples from the novel.
3	Conclusions about baseball culture, based on the novel, are discussed and partially supported with examples from the novel.
2	Conclusions about baseball culture, based on the novel, are discussed but with little supporting evidence from the novel.
1	Conclusions about baseball culture, based on the novel, are minimally discussed, with little to no supporting evidence from the novel.
0	No discussion of conclusions about baseball culture.

Participation

4	Each group member participates equally.
3	Each group member participates, with some presenting a little more than others.
2	Each group member participates, with some presenting considerably more than others.
1	Most of the panel discussion is presented by one or two group members.
0	Only one or two group members participate in the panel discussion.